Capital Metropolitan Transportation Authority

FY 2016-2019

Quadrennial Performance Audit Report

January 25, 2021
Performance Audit Scope and Objectives

- Pursuant to §451.454 of the Texas Transportation Code, a quadrennial performance audit was performed for CapMetro.
- The purpose of the performance audit is to provide evaluative information necessary for state and local oversight and to provide information to CapMetro for improving efficiency and effectiveness of operations.
- The performance audit assessed the following required tasks:
  - Administration and Management of the Authority (Task 1)
  - Compliance with applicable state laws from Chapter 451 of the Texas Transportation Code and other applicable state laws (Task 2)
  - Collection and compilation of base statistics and measurements of specified state-mandated performance indicators (Task 3)

Scope Period:
- FY 2016 – FY 2019
  - October 1, 2015 through September 30, 2019
Summary of Results

- **Task 1:** Administration and Management of the Authority
  - No instances of non-compliance identified
  - Two Recommendations for Management to enhance internal controls, processes, and efficiencies

- **Task 2:** Chapter 451 Statutory Compliance Review
  - No instances of non-compliance identified
  - Four Recommendations for Management to enhance internal controls, processes, and efficiencies

- **Task 3:** Performance Indicator Review
  - No instances of non-compliance identified
  - Two Recommendations for Management to enhance internal controls, processes, and efficiencies
The Quadrennial Performance Audit did not identify areas of non-compliance with Chapter 451 of the Texas Transportation Code, nor a lack of effective controls and oversight, nor where performance did not meet established expectations.

However, eight Recommendations for Management were identified and provided to management for consideration. Management responses to address these recommendations are not required.

Finding vs Recommendation for Management

Finding: The Quadrennial Performance Audit areas identified are considered to be exceptions in which compliance with Chapter 451 is not met, where there are lack of effective controls and oversight, or where performance is not meeting established expectations.

Recommendation for Management: The Quadrennial Performance Audit areas identified are considered to be enhancements to internal controls, processes, procedures, efficiency and effectiveness of operations or improvements to the management of the Authority.
Task 1 - Administration and Management of the Authority

Purpose:
- To assess CapMetro’s administration and management of the authority's departments.

Procedures:
- Utilizing a priority-based approach, we identified with management the areas with a high reliance on third party service providers, highly complex operations, a significant impact on reputation or significant impact on meeting the authority's goals and objectives. The following departments were selected:
  - Bus Contract Operations (BCO)
  - Demand Response Oversight (DRO)
  - Operations and Maintenance Oversight (OMO)
  - Paratransit Administration (PA)
  - Paratransit Eligibility (PE)
  - Paratransit Reservations and Control Center (PRCC)
  - Rail Commuter Operations (RCO)
  - Rail Freight Management (RFO)
- For each selected Department we performed the following:
  - Reviewed staffing levels and the administrative organization of each of the selected departments
  - Reviewed department functionality
  - Reviewed cost elements of each department
Task 1 - Administration and Management of the Authority

Results:

✓ CapMetro have adequate personnel across the selected departments and maintained a stable level of personnel to achieve the department’s mission, goals and functions

✓ Employees have adequate credential and qualifications to perform their assigned duties

✓ Department’s maintained effective budget monitoring processes through collaborative efforts across the authority which resulted in aligned costs and cost elements.

Recommendations for Management:

1. Contract Management System
   - Implementation of a Contract Management System to uniformly monitor and manage performance and financial status

2. Credential and Qualification Tracking of Staff within Operations and Maintenance Oversight
   - Perform a review of credential and qualifications of OMO staff and ensure files are reflective of experience gained through on-the-job training
Task 2 - Chapter 451 Compliance Review

**Purpose:**

- To validate CapMetro’s compliance with Chapter 451 of the Texas Transportation Code and all other applicable state laws, including:
  - Texas Local Government Code
  - Texas Property Code
  - Texas Health and Safety Code
  - Texas Penal Code
  - Relevant legislation as adopted by the 85th and 86th Texas Legislatures

**Procedures:**

- Identified and cataloged **194** unique compliance requirements and applicable updates to Texas Legislation
- Performed interviews with process owners and validated applicability of each compliance requirement
- Reviewed relevant website content, data, and documents to validate the authority's compliance with each requirement.
Task 2 - Chapter 451 Compliance Review

Results:

✓ CapMetro achieved compliance with all of the 194 applicable Texas state laws as prescribed by Chapter 451 of the Texas Transportation Code.

✓ Validated that CapMetro implemented all statutory recommendations from the Sunset Review, as stated by the State Auditor’s Office as issued in the report dated November 5, 2015.

Recommendations for Management:

1. Board Meeting Quorum
   - CapMetro communicate that the quorum has convened within the meeting minutes before a closed meeting begins in accordance with the statute.

2. Dispositions and Destruction Central Tracker
   - Develop and maintain a central tracker compiling lists of dispositions and destruction of documents.

3. Training Requirement
   - Update the record retention procedures to include maintaining a file with the relevant fare enforcement trainings documentation to strengthen its compliance with the statute.

4. Quadrennial Report Delivery
   - Implement a retention of receipts, or proof or submission, for the delivery of the quadrennial reports to the applicable recipients in accordance with the statute.
Task 3 - Performance Indicator Review

Purpose:
- To examine CapMetro’s achievement of the nine key performance indicators in accordance with Texas Transportation Code 451.454 statutory requirements.

Procedures:
- Collected, validated, and assessed performance indicator data from the National Transit Database and/or CapMetro along with an assessment of the trends over the four year scope period, which included:
  - Operating Cost per passenger, per revenue miles, and per revenue hour
  - Sales and Use tax receipts per passenger
  - Fare recovery rate
  - Average vehicle occupancy
  - On-time performance
  - Number of accident per 100,000 miles
  - Number of miles between mechanical road calls
- Identified and considered the impact of organizational changes and events during the period, such as CapRemap and the entering into a single service contract for bus operations.
Task 3 - Performance Indicator

Review

Results:

- **Service Reliability: Improved** On-Time Performance, **lower** accident rates, and **fewer** mechanical road calls **improved** service reliability
- **Internal Cost and Service Efficiency Measures:** Cost of delivering an hour or mile of service **remained** relatively **flat**
- **Cost Effectiveness:** Performance **declined** across cost per passenger trip, fare recovery, and average vehicle occupancy due to a **decline in ridership** prior to the implementation of CapRemap in 2018. Following the implementation of CapRemap, the **trends** were **reversed** and **increases** in ridership occurred between FY 2018 and FY 2019.

Recommendations for Management

1. **Increase of Fares**
   - To **improve** fare recovery rates, continued **coordination** between management and the Board of Directors should be performed annually to **review** and **evaluate** the fare policy, pricing model, and fare practices.

2. **Documentation of Data Reporting and Validation Process**
   - **Formalize** the process for **maintaining** documentation and the storage of data reporting and **validation** within the Demand Response Oversight Department.
Discussion

Alyssa Martin, CPA, MBA | Partner
972.448.6975 | Alyssa.Martin@weaver.com

Adam Jones | Senior Consultant
512.694.7187 | Adam.Jones@weaver.com

Brandon Tanous, CIA, CFE, CGAP, CRMA | Senior Manager
832.320.3275 | Brandon.Tanous@weaver.com

Susan MacClay, MBA, MPA | Senior Associate
512.236.8002, x18 | smaclay@thegoodmancorp.com